

evj v̄ t̄ki ḡh̄: c̄ḡv̄ v̄i AR̄ I m̄ebv

gngȳ t̄nt̄b

"The movie camera was invented in order to penetrate deeper into the visible world, to explore and record visual phenomena, so that we do not forget what happens and what the future must take into account"¹

w̄-šZ, w̄t̄kl K̄ti hv̄ th̄šZvq Aqv̄š-Ges c̄ḡ gngv̄ixi ḡt̄Zv c̄ḡj-civ̄v̄š,-Zv̄ wīt̄x̄ ḡv̄
K̄v̄ḡiv̄K̄ K̄h̄Ri c̄ḡl̄āt̄Ki f̄ḡKv̄q t̄L̄t̄ t̄P̄iq̄t̄j b c̄ḡv̄ v̄i cw̄Kr. ḡb̄ȳ v̄M̄ t̄fZ̄P̄|
Ḡgb̄K̄ ej̄t̄ t̄P̄iq̄t̄j b ḡv̄ K̄v̄ḡiv̄i Aw̄v̄īi K̄v̄Yv̄B̄ GB̄N̄ hv̄ Nv̄Q̄ Zv̄ `k̄ḡb̄Zv̄i M̄x̄i
c̄f̄ek̄ K̄iv̄ `k̄ḡb̄ Nv̄v̄i Z̄ȳ"-ḡj" w̄P̄i K̄iv̄Ges̄ Zv̄ c̄ḡv̄KiȲ| t̄K̄b? h̄t̄Z̄ Aḡiv̄f̄ȳj b̄vh̄B̄ K̄x̄
Nv̄Q̄ Ges̄ f̄w̄l̄t̄Z̄ Aḡv̄t̄ i K̄x̄ḡt̄b̄ iL̄t̄Z̄ n̄t̄e| v̄M̄ t̄fZ̄P̄fi GB̄ ēuj̄ c̄ḡv̄Z̄ D̄v̄w̄ Aḡv̄t̄ i GB̄
K̄_t̄b̄ `v̄iȲ c̄ḡv̄K̄Z̄v̄q̄ ev̄i ev̄i v̄l̄t̄i Av̄nt̄e| w̄t̄kl K̄ti `k̄ḡb̄Zv̄i M̄x̄i c̄f̄ek̄ Ges̄ `k̄ḡb̄
Nv̄v̄K̄ explore ev̄c̄ȳL̄b̄c̄ȳL̄ w̄P̄i K̄iev̄i f̄eb̄v̄, ȳj Aḡiv̄L̄v̄Z̄iq̄ t̄` Le w̄v̄b̄f̄ēt̄e|

v̄K̄š' mev̄K̄q̄i Āv̄M̄GB̄ K̄_t̄bi v̄k̄t̄iv̄bḡ c̄ḡt̄½ v̄K̄q̄^K̄v̄l̄qr| Aḡv̄i ḡt̄b̄ Av̄Q̄, ēQi K̄t̄q̄K̄ Āv̄M̄
ḡv̄h̄ȳ I P̄i'K̄j v̄v̄t̄q̄ GK̄ Aj̄v̄c̄P̄w̄iZ̄v̄q̄ ÔAR̄B̄Ôc̄v̄v̄t̄K̄ v̄t̄i t̄R̄vi Av̄c̄v̄ Z̄t̄j v̄t̄j b̄ Zi'Ȳ KR̄b̄
v̄k̄i x̄| Z̄v̄t̄ i ēĒe" m̄c̄Z̄ v̄j GiK̄ḡ t̄h̄, ḡv̄h̄ȳt̄K̄ Z̄v̄iv̄Z̄v̄t̄ i v̄k̄i iP̄vi GK̄W̄ t̄c̄ḡv̄ȳḡq̄ ḡB̄j t̄c̄v̄-
v̄v̄nt̄e t̄L̄t̄Z̄ c̄b̄ b̄v̄ `v̄w̄ K̄v̄t̄Ȳ| c̄ḡZ̄, ḡv̄h̄ȳx̄i iR̄%v̄Z̄K̄ B̄Z̄n̄m̄ v̄t̄q̄ Z̄iv̄ f̄x̄Ȳ w̄v̄š-Ges̄
v̄Z̄v̄Z̄, ḡv̄h̄ȳx̄i b̄b̄ḡv̄i c̄ȲKiȲ Ges̄ ḡv̄h̄ȳt̄K̄ v̄t̄i Am̄L" ga'ḡ ḡv̄t̄bi Āv̄eM̄v̄k̄x̄ v̄k̄i-
c̄f̄P̄ov̄GK̄ aīt̄bi R̄w̄Z̄M̄ Ac̄v̄ȲZ̄i j̄ t̄Ȳ en̄b̄ K̄t̄iN̄ Z̄v̄iv̄Gi Ask̄ n̄t̄Z̄ P̄b̄ b̄v̄| t̄h̄b̄ Z̄v̄ēj̄t̄Z̄
t̄P̄iq̄t̄j b̄, ḡv̄h̄ȳt̄K̄ Aḡiv̄ Ô̄t̄Z̄'t̄i j̄ t̄nv̄ m̄t̄R̄Ń̄ GB̄ t̄ev̄t̄a Ges̄ w̄k̄t̄m̄ Av̄Z̄Ȳ' K̄īt̄Z̄ c̄w̄i v̄;
K̄t̄q̄K̄ c̄v̄t̄b̄Ȳ e" Z̄v̄i v̄t̄K̄ Z̄v̄iv̄Ab̄ȳh̄v̄M̄ Av̄Oj̄ Z̄t̄j v̄t̄j b̄|

t̄fZ̄P̄fi K̄_v̄i m̄l̄ āt̄iB̄ ev̄j̄ Ḡm̄e Aw̄t̄h̄v̄M̄ t̄fZ̄iB̄ ḡv̄h̄ȳt̄K̄ t̄K̄`^aK̄ti c̄ḡv̄ v̄i AR̄b̄i
m̄c̄eb̄w̄ t̄L̄t̄Z̄ c̄w̄Q̄| A_ev̄AR̄B̄ b̄q, Aḡiv̄ c̄ḡv̄ v̄i `w̄q̄Z̄i c̄v̄j̄t̄bi K̄_w̄v̄ ej̄t̄Z̄ P̄w̄Q̄| t̄h̄
`w̄q̄Z̄i K̄_v̄-šȲ K̄v̄t̄q̄t̄b̄ t̄fZ̄P̄N̄ K̄x̄ Nv̄Q̄ Z̄v̄ f̄ȳj̄ b̄v̄h̄v̄q̄v̄ Ges̄ K̄x̄ f̄w̄l̄t̄Z̄ ḡt̄b̄ iL̄t̄Z̄ n̄t̄e

¹ Dziga Vertov, "From Kino-Eye to Radio-Eye" and "Kino-Eye" in *Kino-Eye: the Writings of Dziga Vertov*, ed. Annette Michelson, transl. Kevin O'Brien (Berkeley, 1984), 87-88 and 67.

Kiŕe hŕZ "visible the invisible, the obscure clear, the hidden obvious, the disguised exposed"³
 nŕq IŕV| Agiv Rwb Gici cŕYVPI AŕBK c_ ŕcwŕŕQ, ŕm c_ cwŕgvi w-wiZ weiY GB
 K_ŕbi nŕebvi eŕŕiB AŕBKUŕ| ŕKŠ' cŕŕWK nŕe lŕUi `kŕKi cŕŕb cŕYZv, y ŕŕq ŕKQ
 AvŕPbv ŕKbbv ZviciB 1971-G Agv` i gŕhy |

ŕM ŕfZŕfi ŕKŕv AŕB aviYq AbŕŕZ nŕq cÂk Ges lŕUi `kŕK dŕY mŕv ŕŕi Avŕŕ
 ngŕR, iŕRbxZ A_ev bZŕj wŕŕq `ZùZcŕYVPI ŕgŕY ii" nŕqŕj | Gi bŕKiY Kivnŕqŕj
 wŕbŕv ŕfviZ | diwŕ ŕfviZ kŕai A_ŕnZ" | ŕhb, Kŕgivi ŕfZi wŕŕq ŕwŕfiY ev eŕK aviY
 Kivi ŕfZi wŕŕq nZŕK Rbvi ŕPŕv| ŕKŠ' wŕbŕv ŕfviZ KŕgiviK ŕKŕv gŕe-agŕ ev cŕŕe
 DŕcbKvixi fŕgKq AeZxŕKŕiŕj | AŕZ G avi vi cŕŕb ŕgŕv Rui'k, ŕm gKŕ A_ev gwiI
 i"ncŕji KŕR GB cŕYZB `k'gb| ŕKŠ' GB wŕbŕv ŕfviZB hLb AvŕgŕKq ŕŕq ŕŕi± wŕbŕv
 Kŕwŕq yŕŕs wŕbŕvevBsj `ŕŕ wŕbŕv(Gi Aek" AŕBK ^ekó'B Avŕv) nŕq ŕM ZLb Zŕ i
 cŕYZv ŕ`Lv ŕM ev ŕei ŕŕgŕ cŕYKiŕYi | Kŕg Avŕv ceŕbaŕZ ŕŕiŕw' ev Nŕbv BZ`w
 eŕŕbi e`cvi, ŕj v nŕZv ŕK AvŕQ ŕKŠ' ŕmB ŕh ŕfZŕ eŕj ŕŕj b "to penetrate deeper into the
 visible world"ŕ ŕmŕv GB cŕŕZŕ nŕe ŕK bv ŕm GK cŕŕeŕU| nZ" Ges ev eZvi ŕh `iZj ŕmŕv
 Zuŕv ŕŕi± wŕbŕv ŕgŕv Abŕe Kivŕj b ŕN G cŕŕDŕVŕj | GgbK ŕŕi± wŕbŕv `beŕK
 Ges ŕŕgŕ nZ" AvŕiŕYi ŕPŕvi gŕa" GK aiŕbi cŕŕZ`cŕŕb, cŕŕl-cŕŕb iŕR%ŕZK iŕkbZvi
 AvŕŕhMDŕVŕj | ŕ`Lv fŕŕZ ÔAbŕŕK ŕ`Lv fŕwŕ÷ GK Gŕyŕŕgi AvŕŕhMDŕVŕj | Av
 ZLbB Gŕmŕj j wZb AvŕgŕKvi Pj ŕŕiKvi dŕŕŕ`v ŕmŕv Avŕ A±wŕI ŕMŕŕbi ŕgŕŕdŕ÷v
 ZZŕq Pj ŕŕiŕi jŕŕŕ" | Zŕ i Pj ŕŕi j vŕ ŕmŕv ŕWj vŕ ŕmŕv GK bZb AwŕK cŕYVPIK
 nŕŕM nŕPZb AskMŕYKvixi fŕgKq ŕŕq Gj | lŕUi AvŕMŕŕj wZb AvŕgŕKq wŕŕei cŕŕŕ, ngŕR
 cŕeZŕbi Aŕŕ`yŕŕb Ges mgŕR`ev wŕŕivax mgŕKRŕs wŕŕivax MZŕŕK-ngŕRZŕŕK Aŕŕ`yŕŕb
 GB Pj ŕŕiŕiŕv ŕcŕŕv I nZ" ŕgŕY KŕiŕQ| Gŕŕe cŕYVPIŕi ŕh bZb nŕebv mŕ nŕqŕj Zi
 mŕj AŕBKlŕb ŕcŕŕŕj Agv` i gŕhy | Gi cŕŕb cŕY ÷ c ŕŕŕvŕw

÷ c ŕŕŕvŕw cŕŕŕ½ G eŕŕiŕi ŕMŕŕZB GK ŕeŕŕŕ yŕŕLŕj g, Ô÷ c ŕŕŕvŕw ŕh ŕKŕv AŕŕB
 nŕq DŕVŕj cŕŕK Rŕbi Qŕ | hy ŕh gŕyŕ i Rŕb" mŕŕŕŕ eŕov ŕŕŕwŕŕŕ Gŕbŕj Ges hŕ i

³ "The Writings of Dziga Vertov," in *The Film Culture Reader*, ed. P. Adams Sitney (New York, 1970), 370, 362.

1971-G gy^h hy Pj Kvj c^onkniKvii Dⁱ vMAⁱvZbW Qe Zw nⁱqQj | Rwi i^vqⁿbiB
cvPj bq G †÷U BR eb^o AjgMi Kvii y^evikb d^vUⁿ Ges evj †P^aixi Bⁱb^vmU
gy^qbm| G ,tj v^cobZ GKW i^vaAR^obi Rⁱb^h hyiZ niKvii c^oYwPⁱ | G †÷U BR eb^obZb
i^voⁱ k^o Ges Zw^eK^h ek^o ,tj vZy aiZ †PⁱqⁱQ| y^evikb d^vUⁿhywlqK c^oYi Qe Av
Bⁱb^vmU gy^qbmwi ,gbyli, wⁱklZ wⁱtⁱ i Acwmg Kó Av `y^rvi c^oYKiY|

gy^h hy wⁱq wⁱ k w^gz meⁱPⁱq A^tj w^z Qe f^vi^zi c^oY^vPI w^gzvGmⁱKⁱ t^ei b^vb g^vsim
Uz^vWg| Qe w^g gy^h xⁱ H^vZnw^k †c^ovU^wK Z^tj ai^v †f^zi wⁱq AMⁱ nⁱq, MⁿZ^v cvK⁻
v^bi †c^vog^w bxZ, kiYv^xkwⁱ, hy, wRqⁿ Gf^ve gy^h w^lqK GKW me^ow c^oY^vPI nⁱq
DV^z †PⁱqⁱQ|

gy^h h^xi b^gv^hme^u wⁱ kxm^sew^k Aei^x esj^v k Ges mg^vseZ^kkiYv^xkwⁱ Ges esj^v k
h^xi †m^eiK^gU^vi^t i K^hq Ges iY^v b n^di Kⁱi^ob| Gngq M^xZ d^zU^ri ng^sq †h^me Qe
w^gz nⁱqⁱQ †m^tj vⁱ †f^zi Agⁱv^tek b^g i^tb^o ev^t Levi n^hMⁿi^qQ iev^oIR^vm^o w^h Kw^o
†g^w di w^rv⁻ vⁱ, †e^bb U^tM m^sK^jb I m^ov^h bq †W^j v^b esj^v k, f^wb^q †K^Dt^j i †g^ri
L^tj `mI^qi | G^ov f^vi^zi w^bq i^q `Zw Kⁱv^ot^jb w^vd^r 71 Ges GBP Gm^oAv f^w I Zi
`t^j i j^v A^vU^h j^v | `v^bZ^vi ci R^vcb GK †U^yw^kb P^vb^tjⁱ nⁱq cieZ^kv^tjⁱ w^kL^vZ
Pj w^vPI w^gzv^bMⁿkI^kg^vw^gY Kⁱv^ot^jb `y^u Qe: R^q esj^v vI i^vg^b: w^h d^v vⁱ Ae w^h †b^kb|

Gne Qe^z esj^v kⁱ gy^h h^xi H^vZnw^k †c^ovU^w, cvK⁻ w^x†n^bv^wbxⁱ n^Zh^hA, e^ov^j `m^bK
Ges Ac^vi R^bm^vi^Yi c^ow^k c^oZⁱva, kiYv^xl^qK g^bw^k w^{ch}q, c^onk niK^vi Mb,
`N^gq^v x^gw^h h^xi c^oY^z, m^s Ges †Mⁱj v^hy, A^vR^wZK A^h esj^v k hy Ges †kl ch^s-g^v
esj^v kⁿ GB w^lq ,tj v^Di^v Gⁱn^oQ| b^vMⁿkI^kg^vi Qe `y^u ev^h w^tj me^kW Qe^b h^xK^y b w^gz
Qe | A^o, Gne Qe^z GK^ai^tbi Z^r †w^kZ^vi †g^rv^r A^tQ| Av Gf^ve †h^vdm^u NⁱUⁱQ Zⁿt^j v
†h^me c^oh^z t^j vⁱ K⁻v^et^j Q Z^t i GK^ai^tbi me^tR^wf Dc⁻cbv Gne Qe^z †L^z cvB| AⁱP^v
j^k, AⁱP^vkiYv^xb^g b^vR^v†c^vov^mg, AR^vb^vkn^ti R^bZ^vi w^rq-D^j mⁿ Gf^ve w^gz nⁱqⁱQ
gy^h h^xi c^ow^k K^vj^wf Bⁱg^r| GiK^g nⁱqⁱB `v^wk| wⁱ k^t i K^vgⁱq av^YKZ. Gne

Pj vPI AibKt[tiB wti± wibgvi AwzK wvz ntiq| ^abZv ceZxAgv`i Pj vPIi th
 Ae^vOj ZqK wtePbv wj Agv`i wR^wvYi t[ti ÷ c tRibmBWGK Amre c[| wtkl
 Kti Pj vPI-A1/4b c[YvPIi th ^b Zv Oj AZ^s-bM^| wibgv nti cvk^wb knKti i
 tXjev tbi wggabi wQzZ_`PI t^Levi AvAZvi eBti `kRI c[wQB t^L w ZLBI |
 cA^tki `kKi bwi Avngt`i nji vZ evlvUi `kK t[tkvqingb Kwii migvmbBb wK itq
 wlvOj `kKi `wi AvotjB| Avi wvZvI AR[Ktib w tKvbw ^KvZ| Gfve c[YvPI
 `w tbi `vPIw ZLb wqvkvj Oj | GB Ae^v ^vewK KvtyB ZZx Pj vPIi AwzK wcev
 hv^vB ^t tki A[1/2 vPI wvY nre nq w Avi tKvbw Pj vPI | A_P KvKwO ngtq tni vbm
 Avi tM[bi ZZx Pj vPIi avYq D[w AmaviY ne QwB bv wvz ntiq| Agv`i giv co[te
 1973-G vYtZ Avj t^ -w[ivaxmgvK kvb Awf[ei ngq wvz w e^vUj Ae vYj Qwi K_v |
 c^wKI ,Rg^vbi GB vZb[teP QvZ GK ch[K^vivicvnb wRi wvZ nIqv `k` ch[
 vIwvZ Kitz t[ti vj b | mgvKRsv w t^ R Agb^ Kti vwb Qw Zj hvOj b Ges GK ch[
 ZqK ,y Kivnq | Ggb Qw Agiv wvY Kitz cvi w vKs^ hvxi DEvci ngq | GgbK hvxi
 ciciB wvz AjgMi Kwii GK mM it^i wlvgtq gy^hv wlvq tnb me[RwvRg[KB
 vIwvZ KitiQ Avi Zi mt_ hv ntiq fxy AteMv[skI I ^t k febv Wei by^v avYKZ
 RM[nj nZ^vAi d[UR e^eni Kti AjgMi Kwi B[tiRi Mxi nZ^-Abv[vbi th nrebi
 BvZ mo Kti vj b Zvati iLvZ cvib w tkl ch[

eis w t^ kx bMnx Ivkv Zu Qw ^vZ K^vWw K^vRvj K^vivi e^enti Ges wtdwf
 WK[Uwi AwzK bZb esj t^ k Avi Zi RvZi wZqK Dc^cb KitiQb | yjLiQb kvv 3/4gvb,
 Othb GK Ab^gb^ gby nZ K^vivi wlv Gtj vgtj v tPL iLvQ m^RvZ GKw t^ tki bvb
 Avic[ti `k^k[| Agiv t^ LIZ cvQ wD gvK[ui eRv[Avei civmRtq entQ t^ Kwiv
 Ivkv nZ aiv Kvcv Kvcv K^vivi wM^kR Avc aivQ n[wi ^Zc, Sj[gsm wKsev mRv[
 ebi^w | Gi ciB nqzvAgiv t^ LQ w^ vq t[ic eRbveRvZ eRvZ Pj tQb D3/4j tM^qv itoi
 Kco civte[w^vZ vici gbyli gv v Lvj wlv tLj vq e^skI `j..... | GKbfve ingb:
 w dv v Ae w tbb QvZI bvb Avic[ti Ac[vZ B[tiR tkl gRe[K aivQb vwb | gv[Gi
 d[K wv^U Kgo w t^ Qb gRe, tkl ivntj i n1/2 bv v tUvj bv v KitiQb, ^tj i t[ti i n1/2

WfVki:Qb| GgbK gRtei m[VKti ngq ZtK tkR Auci e`tj Avgiv`w vWkU, tdtg
Ikgvev`vdxguy vK fvj vte `Lvhuq| 0⁶

Ab`wK yqvi tj vb th Qe Zj Qj b gy`thxvMbi `j Wi tm QeZ Wti± wthgvi `beW K
`iZi Qj B| K`vgiv gse`mbfve ev eK avY KtiQj Ges K`vgivPjK Qj b ARwZ,
AmuKZ| GiKg gse` Kiv bv th, Gne Qe gj`mb ev Zrchab Qj | eis ejvhq gy`hyxi
cöV Kiyi GK HkhEviB tciQj b ZtiK Av K`v_wb gny | wS`wk eQi ci hLb ZtiK
Av K`v_wb gny Awe[®]vi KtiQj b GBne Qe ZLb ZuivbgV KtiQj b Ab` Pj wPIÑ gy` i Mb,
GBne Qe e`envi Kti | Kxfve Zuiv Zt`i nRbkj Zy Melyv Kibkv Ges wliqi cZ
KwUgU wtiq gy` i MbK GKw RzXq cYv bvi cñK cvYZ KtiQj b tmM Ab`I evivi
KwZ ntiQ | tm cñ½ bZb Kti thM Kievi wQz tbB | wS` ejv thZ cti gy` i Mb Zi
wgy%oj xi tfZi wtiq Bigri Mxi cZ mZ`K LjR tciQj Ges GB mZK Bigr Agv` i
thS` -SZiK w-gj U Kitz tciQj | cQ` B` kiki ÔyQj i wewkO`cwtiq ga`-beBtiq hLb
gy` i Mb `Lvtm ZLb nuyQzB GK cñYmR, -ZüZvq tme Bigri m_ nuyKZ teva
KtiQj, fLY BZnngqZv AvuS`-ntiQj, AibK cñZviv cögevi gZv Di`cb KtiQj |
cöVwPI gy` i Mb Agv` i gy`hyxi GK wkl ARB Ges cöVwPI wnte Ggb GK ARB hv
gy`hytK Agv` i RzXq -SZi fvevi mAZ Kitz fvgKvitiLQj |

cti gy` i Mb-Gi mÊ ajiB GimQj gy` i K_v| wQz bPj wPI AwtKi nrebvK w`R KtiQj
GB Qe | bZb cñbY BZnvhvAvi wgeM gbyli thS` -SZi fUviK RzXq BZnmmu,³
KiW GiKg D`PKv[vbiq wgz gy` i K_v | Gi m_ hy` ntiQj wKi Pj wPI i wKi cökb
GK WkzUkb | Film within a film Gi gZv film about showing a film | wS` GZ ne nrebi
mÊcvZ KtiI Qe wnte gy` i Mb-Gi Zj bQ tek LwKuv QgwK, A`vbgK GB cöVwPI |
A_evGB Zj bG Qei cZ mePi Kti bñ GfveI ejv thZ cti, tek wQz bZb nrebi mÊcvZ
KtiQj GB Qe | AibK cti kmvqi Kwi hLb wgy KtiQb hyciva GKvi ZLb bZb cñbY

⁶ kuv ¼vgb, Avb `iki WQz Uw, `k`f ewk mKj b 1411-12, nruv bv gngy` tndnb, cñkK: gbrvi nmb gyv ,
cöV 42-43 |

nRbkj ZvK D^{3/4}weZ KiZ ciZ AwK, wlfvebv Ges mgwM m^{oi} wKí febv| tnB
 tiibnmngq t₋ik tkw KZv nlg, wvDZ Ges GK%aLKZvi th`k^{bi} Ici`w^{iq} AvQ wk!Zvi
 wcixZ thne v^{Sv}thgb DEⁱⁱ Avfe`w^{ev}, c^QPi wgz^{Qj} KR`k^Q evtnMj i QwKZvi`k^Q
 Gntei Ici v^W Kti v^{ti} i bbvcje wKkZ n^{iq}Q wfbong^{iq}| Pj v^{Pi} AvB^{Rb}÷Bb, FvZK
 NUK, Zi^{ikv}w, gb Kvj A₋evj wZb Av^gwKvi w^gZvivGne wKí AwK w^{iq} KvR K^{ti}Qb|
 v^SAv^q i Pj v^{Pi} tn^wK t₋ik tek i^Ykyj Pwⁱ eRvq ti^lQ ej^{ZB} nte| Av^q i thne
 Pj v^{Pi} i K₋v₋ i^zzi m₋ Av^{iv} Av^j Pbv Kti ₋wK Z^q i gj AwK wⁱ w^qw^Rigi mij
 wivfiY Dc⁻cbv t₋ik Av^gZ Ges tnL^{vb} wZ| c^Qv^{Pi} i t^l GK%aLK b^{vi}wf Ges
 tk⁻w^{glx} wlfvebv ev^{ti} Ly tkD hb bv| MZ`B`k^{ki} gy^{hy} i c^Qv^{Pi} i Gi Qc
 t^gUgy^W -úo|

Av^j Pbv Av^{iv} AM^{hi} nIqv Av^{MG}KW w^{lq} -úo Kti thIqv`iKvi| GB K₋tb gy^{hy} i Ici
 w^gZ c^Qv^{Pi} i tk^{vb}c^Y%Zwj KvAwg`Zw KiZ Dⁱ `M^{tb} w| w^{tn} in Ggb A^{ib}K Qw
 w^gZ n^{iq}Q thne Qwi b^g Awg D^j L Kie bv| KvY c^UW Qwi gj`w^{Pi} G K₋bi Dⁱk`bq|
 GgbK thne Qwi K₋vAwg D^j L K^{iv}Q Ges Kie Z^q i gj`w^{Pi} evf^y R^vigU Av^{iv} Dⁱk`
 bq| Awg eis, Gne Qwi w^{Qz}^ekó` w^{iq} Av^j Pbv Kti gy^{hy} K^{fte} Av^q i c^Qv^{Kv} i
 v^{ki} v^Svk D^{3/4}weZ K^{ti}Q Zv e^Sz P^BQ Ges c^Qv^{Kv} i^v K^{fte} gy^{hy} i c^U Z^q i`q
 t^gU^Q Zv R^bz t^Pov Kiv| Avⁱ G c^Qqvⁱ B Ask w^{nte} g^S g^S e^{tj} hw^Q Av^{iv} w^{Qz}
 n^ebi K₋v|

e^vμgx Pj v^{Pi} -^{ab}Zv gy^{hy} KxAR^Q KiZ t^Piq^{Qj}? w^QB -^{ab}Zv v^S Kvi -^{ab}Z^q
 w^QB Kwj gb M^{gi} ,i`^{nk} g^{Etj} i -^{ab}Zv Avei Pj v^{Pi} w^gZv B^{qng}b Kwⁱⁱ iI -^{ab}Zv|
 Kⁿⁱ -^{ab}Z^q? GKR^{bi} me[^]nwi^{iq} w^{ri} gb^{bi} w⁻Zv L^{iq} t^Kto Levi AwKvi c^Uvi
 -^{ab}Zv AvⁱKR^{bi} Pj v^{Pi} Kvi w^{nte} w^R -[^] w^l t^{ci} -^{ab}Zv n^qZv ,i`^{nk} g^{Etj} esj^q k
 b^{gi} GK w^{iq} M^s-e^{ci} e^w K c^UK g^v| KvY G^{fte}B, w⁻ v^Y gZ^{gq}, i³v³ c^U i^q w^{iq}
 GLb Awb⁻,-nZek, Ai^rK esj^q k| -^{ab} e^fUB| Avⁱ B^{qng}b Kwⁱⁱ tⁿ t^{ki} B GK
 Pj v^{Pi} w^gZv^W b^{ix} -^{ab}; AZGe m^Mg^x| Av^hGB th, B^{qng}b Kwⁱⁱ `w^l c GB Pj v^{Pi} GB
 Awb⁻Zv GB Ai^rKZvGes GB m^Mg^{ik} avⁱ K^{ti}Q -Z^uZ^{Aw} K| GK%aLK b^{vi}wf i e^{ab}

Avi aviYv BvZnqmi Aw`S`Yxq gup, tj vi huiv m[xntq _vKb Zuiv GiKg AmaviY D`PiY
KiZ cvib h_vh_fve AbvWZ teva Kitj, Zv`i tfZti tmgqWk Rwmq ZjzZ cvitj hLb
Zuiv wgv KiQtb BvZnm ev hWQtb BvZnqmi gup`[Yi tfZi wiq| G Rtb` c[urB
Pj vPI wgvzi cDi BvZnqteva, Melyv wRi `wfwz nruKnyuo aviYvGes wliqi cZ Mxi
`vteva|

GB Awk wgv Zbfxi tgvkpsj i Pi Nvi cgvwP 1971-Gi wZxq Aa`vqi cOg cOkBx
AgivGB tmgvi hLb KiQ ZLBI Pjtq GKw temiKwi tUjwkb Pvbjt | MKjy wRq wefm
GB Qvi cOg Aa`vqW` LfZ wq gib ntiqo Gw Avgt` i gvhxi BvZnmGKw gBj dj K Kvr
ntq _vKte | K`-BvZnm iPvq Zbfxi tgvkpsj i cv`kzi KviY Zu BvZnqteva, MelyvGes
Zu wliq-wvovZv| Pj vPI wnte cQ wQB` Levi tbb GLvb; A_ev thUKzAvq Zv tbnvB
Pj vPI i wtvwqj dgwvi KviY | wS`D`PiYi gta` Avq th nZ`i evjovZvZvK Dxi KiZ
tctiqv vlv | GB civ gvhxi iRbxZ, MnZ`v KibxZ, bixwhzb, kiYv wchqN cQ
me`vcx| cO iRbxZK t`ik mgb` gbyN nKtj B ejvZB nZ`i Hkh Ggbk hLb dzUR
e`eni Ktib vlv tnlvBI Zv`i AeRwvW Avgt` i wvSZ Kti | K_vZv` i cOjZ wvbwk
Qvotq bZb KtbvUkb mo Kti evivi Ges gvhxi BvZnm vgwK nq I`v| thUKy` tLQ,
MKjy, ZvZ GKw K_vAek` gib ntiqo th, 1971 Pj vPI w efv tek GK%ak Ges GKglx
eU| tKv_v tKv_v GKw`vZ-cj wK Kwv gvGB K`-BvZnqmi tfZiB iPvKivthZ w bv tm
vAvv gib tRtMQ| wkl Kti iRbxzi Astk Gw GB Qvi nru` nZ cvZ| AgivAvgt` i
RvZ-ivof D`te i Klvv, tj vRbZ cvZg Ges eweK wZik`hmwiz cvZg| gib ntiqo
Gne K_vjvZ BvZnm _KvAvi huiv Moiqv BvZnm Zv`i K`ib tkvi gta` tgvjK cv`K`
AvqN ASZ RbPZib| Zbfxi tgvkpsj GB Krv Kivi Rtb` AbZg thw gby eU!

GB K`-BvZnm hv`i cQvqZB wgv ntiqo tdsRqvLvbi Pj vPI tmK_vetj hB Ges tKv_v
cve Zvi | tmK_vetj hB Qvi mdj` BvZnqmi wgvYi Ges cOskzi cgvKiYi | by LvB
GK wgvw vhwZz gwj vhi mmmD`PiY GB nrebvmv Kti th Gfve Agive`wMZ`hi
BvZnqmi AmaviY e`vugx Nub, tj vi cgvKiY KiZ cvie Ges Avgt` i thS` _Szi fvevi
tKej exi thv vbgmb gZz Av wRtqi Kwv bq; mgb` gbyli Amgb` nq Ivi nrvv
M` tj v Rgv _vKte ntiZve K`-BvZnm iPvi GB aviw ngx nq DVKN Gw Avgt` i KvQ

fXlYfde Kvg | GiKg mdj Qw ,tj vnrúK Agivej tZ PB tmK_vhvej v tMQj tkvqn cñt½
 "The film records "the look of those who have seen." It is an artifact against the erasure of
 history, of the "artifacts,"⁹

Aevi Bqungb Kwñi ~abZv ckcwk gyñhxi cöVwPî G Avik bix`wñc | wñqi
 cÜ A`vcQP Ges Pevs`wtqj BtRkñb Aek` `vi`Y wfbe KŠ` G hñvgñ ii` nñqñQ ðhb | KvY,
 gyñhxi bixi ðh fgKññ mñtm nñMñb, Z`vMZv KYgñ Agv` i Pj wPî ev BZññmi Ab`
 gva`g AgivaviY KiñZ cwñ w | ~abZv Pjk eqi ci cÜgeñii gñZvñsev`cñ cW Kij g
 GK nZ` w`abixi K_vñwb, cwK`wb nbn`vñ` i mñ_ Vwj GñRñUi fgKv Avfbq Kñi AŠZ
 vZbev Z` i gyñhxi` i AvugñYi vKñi cñYZ Kñib | ðkl chŠ`cwK`wb ðnbivZu Avfbq
 añi ðñj Ges knigq GKW Mñi ðcññ ðeta ZñK wñto ðewñq Zu j k wññc Kñi b`ñZ |
 Agv` i `fM gyñhxi ejñZI AgivñKej ðcvK civewñxi tñ du i vBUB eñj g | KŠ` gyñhxi
 AvivAñbK wññ bixñm AñbK wñz Aevi AñbK wñz wñZv | G BZññmbixi ðPL QovDñ
 Avñe by KvY AgivñZvcyñ`cñb `wñi wñKiY KiñZ cwñ w GLbI |

m`cñKKñj wñZ dw` Avñgñ i GKññii c`hñx cjk inñj i Qw i`v` cñi, Avñ` i
 waev` i Mñ A_eviñk` Avñgñ i wñj wñvQwi gñ AñññK añi ðññññ mññvKñ | Gi mñ_ hñ
 nñqñQ ðKv`ñ wñYUkñb, wfokñ gva`ñgi mñññ` Añe`wññK ðRv` vi KivA_evdññRi e`eni |
 KŠ` gyñhxi`K wññññ Aewññii wñqñB Gme Qwi cñb ARñ | hñxi ngqKñi ðñB iYñb,
 kiYv`ñkwi Av bññb jñki e`wñ BigR cvi nñq Agv` i cöVwPî ðcññZ Pñ`Q gyñhxi
 AYñññ, hñ ðñZi jñññ AvñQ gyñhxi bñgi GwñKi vññññ Aevññ wññññi mñebvñ Agivññ
 Qwi ðñZi wñq ðñB vññññ Aevñññi wññññ c` mññ GLbñññ wññññ Gici Avñe
 AwññKi A`wñññññ |

Ab`wññK, AcivñRq evñj v BZññññK wññññ Kñi Ges ngKññi mññññ GK ngñññññ BZññññK
 `ñb Kñi | gyñhxi `ñiK fv`ñ wññññ Kivñññññ nZkñi wññññ MD`ñññññ Rvññññ iññññ
 Avñ Rvñññ ðññ `ñññññ GB gññ ngñññññ µgñññññ Rvñññññ iñññññ | KŠ` ð`Lvñññññ Gi wñññññ AvññK

⁹ Shoshana Felman and Dori Laub, "The Return of the Voice: Claude Lanzmann's *Shoah*," in, *Testimony: Crises of Witnessing in Literature, Psychoanalysis and History* (New York, 1992), 204-283

ejv th wlq, wtkvi bix`i eqtmÜKvj i msMö Ges Zt`i cÖZ mgwRK `ewZÑ GtK GK
 eOvj K-wutK cwYZ Kti | Gne AwK gw`hyxi cÖV`PÎ wgyY AbycÖYi KR Kitz cvi |
 cÖV`PÎi AwtKi wlqW AgtK fwZ Kti bbfvte | Agiv t`tLQ `wvZv ev wQzgv`v
 AcivRq esjv gw`hyxi cÖV`PÎi AwtK wboctRvR mō KitiQ | Zte GKW K_v wvAZ
 iYkxj tkvtjI thwMKitZ PB | cÖV`PÎi wKÝUkkb GKW bvk wlq | AtBK m`ebvgq
 Pj vPÎi wKÝUkkibi gqvexwkmNVZKZv AcNVZ gZzi wKvi ntq:Q | tKbbv wKÝUkkibi gta`
 wKkb/bb-wKkibi t`qj t`tO t`Iqvi wlqW Dn, thb Dte`wB th, Agivbb-wKkibi IciB
 iLQ Av`v wš`wKÝUkkb Agt`i BZnmPZbvGes `k`PZbvq MÖYthM nevi Rtb` `we Kti
 BZnm-mnZ kw`gb Bigr wgyZ hv bUk, Awk`-cbive`i Ici bi DVZ cvi t`j cÖ`vZ
 nq | Ab`w`K mnuZ, m/z, BZnmi Ab` Aa`vqi ngcZb, gx Gne wgtj hw cÖV`PÎ ntq
 DVZ cvi eyew`K wíPPZvntj ÖN`ÖwöZ nq Aevta, `kKi tPZt | Gw Agvi GK wÁv
 AtBKUvbtRi KvQI, esj v`iki gw`hyxi QwtK wkl`K tKej wltqi t`fZi w`tqB Rbte, bvK,
 AwtKI `wte Agt`i wR`wRgyj tUtUg!

gw`hyxi GK wboctU UZbfxi t`gKv`sj i `cöG | esj v`ik eneviz D`PdxRbtMöxi Ici
 wgyZ GB Qw gw`hyxi ghyUw`wB AvtK Aa`v thb | Zbfxi t`gKv`sj Syk wltq:Q Gfve
 th, Zu Qwi w`t`x RvZ-wi`xZi AwthMDVZ cvi | wš`vZ GB t`z`RbtMöxi, huivGt`iki
 fdlwZ nsl`y NymcÖq, Zt`i UvRwÑ wtkl Kti bZb cÖtbi Ici tPtc emv BZnmi `v,
 ce@y`tli Ak`v fy wvš`Avi KruZ ivRbxZi wKvi nevi `vñ Gntei cÖV`KiY KitiQ |
 1971-Gi i^v Aa`v cvi bvtq G cÖtbi K`tbi t`cÖZ cvi b w Zbfxi t`gKv`sj | tmgqKi
 AtBK A`wKi `SZPiY G Qwi Ask ntq AvQ | G Qw Agt`i nkj tK ngbfvte nšö Kti w |
 wš` MnZ`vi gb`Ei tevSi tPov G Qw ntZ cvi GK wtkl DcE Av Agt`i gw`hyxi
 Pj vPÎi DËi-RvZxZev`x wš`v nskó nIqvi cÖ`gK ac | cÖ`gKB w? G K`tbi iitZB
 etj vj g, ÷c tRtbnBWB Agt`i cÖg DËi-RvZxZev`x Pj vPÎ-c`Pov | tm ct` G AvtK
 c`t`c Zvntj Ñ wbgv`vi hwI |

esj v`iki gw`hyxi GK etovGes AÜKvi Aa`v MnZ`vGes hyciva | AgivRvb wöizvq Ges
 Rxb I m`ut`i t`vzi wntte wsk kZtKi GK cÖb gbwK wchq NtU wltq:Q IB bggm

Avgt` i t` ik | Avgt` i RzXq UvRWGB th` abZvi Pi` kK ci GLbI AvgivAfc` vKiQ tm
 ngqKvi nKj gbeZwefivaxAcivtai wPti | Avgt` i cöV` Wl, gy` hxi, GB wPi-cöqvi
 mnqK kw` wnte KZLwb mdj fte KVR Kiße Zv wtePbv Kti t` Lv thZ cvi | cöV` Wli
 HvZnmK GK fvgKvev` vq cöt` ½ ej tQb cvjviwefbDBUR, "The historical documentary not
 only tells us about the past, but asks us to do something about it as well-to act as the Angel of
 History and redeem the present through the past."¹⁰ 1971-G Avgivw` e` vUj Ae vji gZv Qw
 wgy` KiZ cvi w nZ, vKs` cti MnZ` vAvi gbwK wchq eviev cöV` KZ ntqQ Avgt` i
 Qwiz | ii` KtiQj b AjgMi Kwi tcvMg Bb esj v` k Qwi ga` wtq | Zvici Zbfxi
 tgvKvstji` sz 71 t` ik ii` Kti m` cZKKtji tmK` vej hb, i³ v³ cöi, wae v` i Mj,
 hyciva 71 Ggb AvivAjbK Qw GB KVR KtiQ | G aviq mdj KvRi Rib` cPvRb BZnmni
 cZ kZfMwbtg` vqeva, mVK MelyvGes wliqi cZ GKwöZv | wkl Kti wPiKvth` mnqK
 ntZ tmj Ly tevgv` i participatory evreflexive documentary e` wöZvi Afvei Avthv` MewZj
 ntq thZ cvi | Avei m` cZ t` Lv tmj tgv` K Avgt` i WB vjyq 71 | G Qw t` Lz wmq gib
 ntqQ, hycivtai wPi-cöqvi hv` AvRwZK RbgZ Mibi wlvw tKvbf` te , i` ZcY` ntq I tV
 Zvntj GiKg Qw Kvhri fvgKviLz cvi | KvY Gi GK A` wK fdvAvQ hv` t` k I ntqi
 e` eab cvi ntq gby` k QZ cvi | Ab` w` k cöV` KtiYi cPöw tZvAvQb |

G chq AvgivGKW mins` c KiZ cvi gy` hxi cöV` Wl wtq |

K. Abb` ÷ c tR` bwmBW hvwkgbeZvi` y` tj cviYZ;

L. hXKj` b esj v` iki e` w` K cöV` KiY;

M dDÜ dzURi Ici wfp` Kti wgz gy` i Mb hv gy` hxlqK Avgt` i thS` `SZ` k w` gy` U
 KtiQ GK` xNAÜKvi ntqi ci;

N. wgeM` gby` i nsMg Ges Z` vM cöV` KiY;

O. bZb cöibY BZnmhv`

P. gy` hxi K` -BZnmwgy`;

¹⁰ Paula Rabinowitz, Wreckage upon Wreckage: History, Documentary and the Ruins of Memory, *History and Theory*, Vol. 32, No. 2. (May, 1993), pg 132

Q. MnZ'vi cÖY'KiY Ges hyKj x b wò® Nubvi AYvî wgv;

R. gv hyxi BZnqmbvix`w wî¶c;

S. DËi RzXqZev`xwšv nskó nevi mnmkc`¶c;

T. `fgvq ntj I AwKMZ vix¶vevbZbZj|

ejv¶hZB cti gv hyxi cÖY'vîi AR® Ly mgb` bq Ges Gi mœbM bbvai¶bi wgvzi
 ¶fZi wîq µgvZ wKkZ n¶Q| ¶fZ¶ th BigtRi Mxi nZ` Abyv¶bi K_vetj vj b ¶m`v
 Avg` i wgvZivMÏY Kti¶Qb wðqB| vKš` gîb iLv` iKvi BtgR bgK Ae†R±B GLb bbv¶e
 P¶j ¶Ai mšz| cÖ nÏ`v teKve¶. i R†jv†K"Qv meMœkcY`-ns`vZ, f¶q¶j>U, ckwKiKg
 Bw¶ciqY WRUj BtgR| Gme DRb ¶v¶j Z†eB nZ` Btg†Ri RvqM Rvq†b ¶c¶¶bi ¶Pov| vKš`
 ¶h`v Acbviv Z†j w†q¶Qb K†a ¶m`v ¶Zvenb K†ZB n†e; Awig c_ Pj v RvZ†K ¶c¶¶
 ¶`Iqv R†b` Ñ n†Z`, BZn¶mi | Iqv¶i teÄwgh†K `šY Ki`b, "For every image of the past that
 is not recognized by the present as one of its concerns threatens to disappear irretrievably"¹¹ |
 `f¶M¶h, Avgivevivi GgvZi K†j wf W†gbwq¶ Avvš`-nB| cÖY'vî wgvZiv¶mU Av n†Z
 ¶`†eb bÑ GB AkvKi¶Q|

¹¹ Walter Benjamin, "Theses on the Philosophy of History," in *Illuminations*, ed. Hannah Arendt, transl. Harry Zohn (New York, 1968), 255.